

**CITY OF DARLINGTON  
REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING AT 6:00 PM  
WEDNESDAY -AUGUST 15, 2018**

**PRESENT AT MEETING:**

Mayor Gloria Hines, City Manager, Mr. Howard Garland and Councilpersons: John Segars, Carolyn Bruce, Sheila Baccus, Bryant Gardner, Elaine Reed and John Milling. Also, present: City Attorney Kevin Etheridge, Building Official Alex Gainey, Mr. Kinsaul, Mr. Linwood Epps, Mrs. Betty Jackson, Ms. Jannie Lathan, Mr. David Brown, Mr. & Mrs. Roger Gore, Ms. Judy Alexander, Ms. Hannah Dixon, Mrs. Thelma Dawson, Mr. Coleman Cannon, Mr. James Jackson, Mr. Donald Gilliard, Mr. Willie Pearson, and other visitors.

**NEWS REPORTERS**

Also present were News Reporters from the News & Press and the Morning News.

**INVOCATION**

Councilwoman Carolyn Bruce did the invocation.

Mayor Hines said last Tuesday at the Council meeting we were in a discussion about a lift station on Joe Louis Blvd. and we needed more discussion on it. So tonight, we will talk about the Joe Louis Lift Station grant application approval. She said the discussion included Lathan Consulting Company and Davis & Brown. Mr. Garland gave a recap of the meeting. He said they had 4 or 5 budget meetings last spring and one night they presented water and sewer needs to their Mayor & Council. He said one of the items presented for 2018-2019 was the upgrade of the Joe Louis Lift Station. Mr. Garland said that station handles all of our sewer on the By-Pass. He said in the past we didn't have that much sewer on the By-Pass but with the additional fast food restaurants and Walmart, this lift station is key to our growth on the By-Pass. Mr. Garland said they mentioned to Council that they would like to upgrade the parts and machinery for the lift station, so everybody nodded in agreement at the meeting and seemed to think this was something that needed to be done. Mr. Garland said they

talked loosely among staff about putting in this application with S.C. Rural Infrastructure Authority (SC RIA). He said he had consultation with Ms. Jannie Lathan of Lathan Consulting Corporation and probably two weeks ago she presented him with an application for the RIA grant between the City of Darlington and Lathan Consulting Corporation. He said they had some preliminary talks about that and as we had done the RIA application which Ms. Lathan had done for the City of Darlington in 2016 & 2017, he told her he had to take it to Council to get it approved, which she agreed. He said they also talked briefly about engineering services for the project. He said our engineer for water & sewer is Davis & Brown and he spoke frankly with her about this. Mr. Garland said they weren't sure about Davis & Brown's willingness to work with Ms. Lathan. He said in the meeting last Tuesday when Mayor Hines asked Mr. Brown in open meeting if he would work with Ms. Lathan if she were awarded the RIA grant and he left it open-ended and said he was not sure. Mr. Garland said he talked with Davis & Brown about trying to mediate and build a bridge between the two and maybe handling the PER (Preliminary Engineering Report) and Mr. David Brown offered to do the application and the administration of the grant for free, so he brought this to Council and it was discussed last Tuesday night. He said Mr. Brown did not have any type of formal presentation which was brought up at the Council meeting and discussed at length. He said Council decided to reconvene this week to give Mr. Brown a chance to put together some type of proposal. And to be fair, he asked Ms. Lathan yesterday if she wanted to write a letter outlining what she has done for the City of Darlington and she hand delivered a letter to him this afternoon and he gave a copy to each of them. Mr. Garland said he will be glad to answer any questions as it relates to the work record of Lathan Consulting Corp. and the work record of Davis & Brown. He said if anybody asks him for an opinion about any of this he will be glad to give it, but as reminder, State law says the City Manager can discuss issues, but he doesn't have a vote. Mayor Hines told Mr. Garland when she talked to him Friday before last he didn't say anything about Davis & Brown and she only learned about it on Monday before the meeting and Mr. Garland said, "That is correct". Mayor Hines said Ms. Lathan had already submitted her contract in the packet so why didn't Davis & Brown submit something. Mr. Garland said Mr. Brown told him to his face that they would do it for free. Mr. Garland said it's his obligation to bring to Council information such as this. Mayor Hines told Mr. Brown since he didn't present last week she will let him present first. Councilman Milling asked Mr. Brown if he's seen the submission that Mr. Garland talked about (what Ms. Lathan prepared). Mr. Brown said he has

not. Councilman Milling said there were some bullet points made with respect to certain things that were alleged to have been said at the last meeting and in fairness he thinks Mr. Brown should at least see what it says. Councilwoman Baccus said even though Mr. Brown may or may not have seen Ms. Lathan's contract it was read out loud, open and in public. She said some Council members questioned her (Ms. Lathan's) numbers, her amounts so Mr. Brown heard what her contract said which gave him an opportunity to go back and create his contract based on what her contract said. She said this is a legal issue and should never have been read out loud. Mr. Brown said her (Ms. Lathan) contract is for the application and grant administration. Mr. Brown said he don't know how to say anything other than "free". Councilwoman Baccus said, "I'm looking at what you submitted to us and I still don't see "free". Mr. Brown said what he's submitting is the engineering cost. He said his offer is to do the grant application, the engineering and construction inspection. He said he is not going to charge for the grant application and administration. For the engineering and design, he will charge \$28,200 and for construction inspection he will charge \$18,000 which is based on him knowing that system, knowing his input and how much time he will have. Councilwoman Reed told Mr. Brown she was not at the last Council meeting, but her concern is since she has been on Council her experience with Davis & Brown has not been the best for the City of Darlington simply because he has been a consultant for a number of years. Mr. Brown said roughly thirty-five years. Councilwoman Reed said she thought that whatever he would propose would be most high level so that is why she is very apprehensive about the fact that he waited until now to present this proposal. She said, "As a consultant you would have known the condition". Councilwoman Reed said she is becoming keenly aware of the problems that we're having that's relative to the engineering work in Darlington. She said she didn't know it was going to be an issue that we already had a qualified person that has already proven that they can get the grants and administer it or do whatever needs to be done to get things done in Darlington. Councilwoman Reed asked Mr. Brown why he wants to do this for "free"? She said, "It's already costing us because you have waited late, and we had to offer you or make allowances for this company to come in with this". She said, "I do not understand why you treat the City this way when you have been that kind of consultant all these number of years". She said if this is something that you wanted, you would have come to this City Council meeting also prepared and when you made that offer of doing it for "free", it doesn't mean that it's always the best. Councilwoman Reed said, "You said you have been the

consultant for this City for thirty-five years and we are experiencing a lot of problems that deal with the services that you provide”. She said, “We shouldn’t be to this place that we’re in competition and that you would say or indicate that you can’t work with another one”. Councilwoman Reed said, “Both of you have provided great services at times to this City and we are about going forward and we are at a point where we’ve got to fix these things. And to have companies that can’t work together, who both are consultants with this City, makes me a little apprehensive about that”. She said she would like to see a different attitude. Councilman Milling asked Councilwoman Reed what problems was she talking about with the engineering services”? Councilwoman Reed said when we had the grant that was offered in the State of South Carolina, only two were given. One was given to Darlington and submitted by Jannie Lathan/Lathan Consulting. Councilwoman Reed said when it was sent in, the design or whatever Davis & Brown’s input was, the State said it was not sufficient and we almost lost the grant. Councilwoman Reed said, “Once they got that answer back and in order to maintain the grant, we had to have a panel to interview bids for the engineering companies to come up with a different one”. Councilwoman Reed said Councilman Milling was on the panel. She said she was very critical because we had to redo that process because of what Davis & Brown submitted; the engineering company that has been the consultant for thirty-five years. Mr. Brown said, “First of all, you got the grant and then after getting the grant, you decided to go out for the engineering. He said they worked with Ms. Lathan on the grant and they got it. Davis & Brown said after they decided to go out for engineering, they submitted a bid but evidently, they did not make an adequate submittal, and they did not get the grant. Mr. Brown said your engineer said they could not do it like they had proposed it to be done. He said nobody came back to him and it was very late in the project (about 6 months) as he recalls. Mr. Garland said from his understanding Hanna Engineering said it was engineered from the middle but there was nothing from the beginning and nothing at the end. He said Hanna Engineering wanted to start at the beginning and go until the end of the project and that it was engineered in the middle. Mr. Garland said the contract was awarded to Hanna in June 2017, so it had to be sometime during the fall of 2017. He said Hanna Engineering pointed out that the design did not cover the entire area that was affected. He said if you just went in and worked on the Chalmers Street area, you’re not really doing anything. He said you might be piping the ditch but you’re not moving the affluent down where it needs to go. Mr. Brown said he disagrees with that, but nobody came back and asked him about it when it happened so there’s

not much he can do about that. Councilman Milling said he was a part of it and as he recalls, Mr. Hanna started out just doing engineering and there was various proposal and recommendations were received from Ms. Lathan as to who should engineer it and other statements were made from people who were involved with the process about who should engineer it and Hanna got the contract. Councilman Milling said Mr. Hanna said he thinks it should be done in this fashion, but he didn't throw any stones at Davis & Brown based upon the information that was available. Councilman Milling said Mr. Hanna indicated that during his process of evaluating and looking at it after he had been awarded the contract, he wanted to expand it and make it a larger project. He said Mr. Hanna never said there was anything was wrong with the engineering. Councilman Milling said, "So I just don't know when we say we've got engineering problems from somebody who's done work for us for thirty-five years and we hadn't mentioned it to David so what somebody has said was a real problem, I don't see it as a problem". Mayor Hines said, "He said the design went up to the railroad and it stopped, it needed to go beyond the railroad". Mayor Hines told Mr. Brown he didn't say anything that was wrong about you. Mr. Brown said it depends on how much you want to drain. The more you want to drain the deeper the pipe is and the bigger the pipe. Councilwoman Bruce asked Mr. Brown if he has done work for the City before for free and did it pertain to grants? Mr. Brown said, "Yes". Mr. Brown said he doesn't like the word "free" even though he used it. Councilwoman Bruce said she will rephrase it. She asked Mr. Brown if he has written and administered a grant for the City of Darlington for free before and he said, "Yes". Councilwoman Bruce said her understanding is that is what he is proposing to do at this time; to write the grant and administer the grant. Councilwoman Bruce asked Mr. Brown if he is awarded this grant does he have engineers on staff to do this work and he said he has engineers on staff. She asked if those engineers have done work for Darlington before as it pertains to a lift station and he said, "Yes". Councilman Segars said, "Let's clarify something too-concerning Chalmers Street ditch. He said the ditch was not draining because we had a real dry spell there and nothing was moving, but every time we've had rain since then that ditch is draining, but maybe not as fast as we want it to, but it's draining. He said if memory serves him correctly, when we wrote the grant for the \$400,000 to do the ditch you were doing the part of the ditch that people were complaining about where the odor was. He said you engineered it based on the size of what the grant was. He said water was still moving and if we would have piped the ditch and covered it up water still was going to move out of there, so there's no flaw in his engineering it's

just that somebody else decided they wanted to make a bigger scope out of the project. Councilman Segars said we're not a \$400,000 we're pushing \$3 million dollars now. He said Mr. Brown had the City's best interest when he was engineering what the grant was proposed for. Councilwoman Reed said she doesn't have knowledge of all that other stuff, she is dealing with the information that was brought to her. She said the information she received is that they did not accept what you proposed for this grant. Mr. Brown said he does think that is correct, but he was not there, but all he knows is that they had the grant and when they went out for engineers and did preliminary work and now it has changed. Councilman Reed said as a Councilperson when that came to her she felt like they needed to deal with it and the next thing that was set up was to open it up so that other companies would be able to submit. Mr. Brown said it wasn't brought to you then. He said it was merely somebody that executed what their preliminary showed it to be at the point and it wasn't until later until that the project scope changed. Councilwoman Reed said, "If there was a chance to do what John has outlined to just address Chalmers Street, why didn't nobody accept that? She said they said, "No". Mr. Brown said you've got to trust the engineer that you select and if you hire an engineer and they say do something, that's what you need to do and that's what you did. Councilwoman Baccus said her concern is this-Mr. Garland submitted to them their packets on Thursday and there was only one application in it that pertained to Ms. Lathan. She asked Mr. Garland when did he decide that Davis & Brown was going to do it for "free"? Councilwoman Baccus said if Davis & Brown was going to be included in our meeting (because they were not a part of our agenda) why wasn't something submitted in their agenda pertaining to Davis & Brown? Mr. Garland said he thinks it was either Wednesday or Thursday of that week. Councilwoman Baccus said if it was Wednesday or Thursday of that week why wasn't it included in their packets. Mr. Garland said this was something that Mr. Brown told him to his face and not anything that was presented in writing. Councilwoman Baccus said she doesn't think it should be a consideration because it was not a part of their agenda. She said Ms. Lathan has done two applications for this Council and received them both (one for \$500,000 and one for \$444,870). So, she has the ability to write these grants and get the grants for the City. Councilwoman Baccus said when you send somebody to bid for something, you want to send the best and she's fighting for the best for her Ward. She said based on Ms. Lathan's reputation of getting these grants, to her, that's their best choice and the fact that she submitted her application to the City on time and when it was due, the grant should be awarded to the person who earned it.

Councilman Gardner said he was made aware that Ms. Lathan presented a contract in reference to this contract the week they got their Council packets and he was also made aware that Mr. Brown offered to do it for “free” during the same period. Councilman Gardner said contracts in the past haven’t been such a touchy issue with them as a Council. He said we sold Auddie Brown our frontage road with no contract with the guidance that our lawyers and their lawyers will get together and we trust that they will come up with something that’s best for the City and they were fine with that. Councilman Gardner said a couple of agenda items later they now have an issue with granting the project to Davis & Brown because they lack a contract. He said he has no problem going with either one. He trusts our lawyer, he trusts Davis & Brown and he trust our City Manager to do what’s best for the City. He said in the future, if they want to go with contracts for all items, he’s fine with that. He said what he doesn’t like is when we have one rule for one thing and another rule for another and that’s how he sees this tonight. Councilman Gardner said he doesn’t doubt Ms. Lathan’s ability to write a good grant and he doesn’t doubt Mr. Brown’s ability to write a good grant, but he has seen issues with one of their work that doesn’t satisfy him. He said there have been outbursts within the Council meetings on multiple occasions that go against facts so that gives him serious reserves. Mayor Hines said as for Auddie Brown issue we must do two readings. She said we can’t afford to repair or fix the street, so it’s best that we sell it, but we gave it to the lawyer and if he brings something back saying that we can’t do it, then we won’t do it because we haven’t had second reading. Mayor Hines said the best thing would be to try and help Mr. Auddie Brown get the street because he’s going to pave it and he’s not going to stop cars from coming through. She said if we already had second reading on it that would be different. Mayor Hines said if for some reason he can’t acquire the street for that, then he won’t get it. She said this is a different issue that we’re talking about. She said this issue has been going on for over eight years and it needs to be fixed. Mayor Hines said if Davis & Brown had sent in their application at the same time, it would be a different thing, but they didn’t do that. Mayor Hines said, “I’ve been on Council for about eighteen years and the time that I’ve been here when she was fresh on Council, in the Council meetings some nights it wouldn’t even be on the agenda and they would come up behind you and say we’ve got to vote on this tonight; it’s an emergency. She said, “We didn’t have chance to read nothing; everything was given to you”. She said at that time I guess you prepared the grants, you administered the grants, you did the engineering, you did everything. There was no check and balance. Mayor Hines said there was no procurement

done until last year when they voted on it. She said things were never bid out when she first got on Council. Mayor Hines said, "We always had to vote then when it pertained to something about you, you did it all". Councilman Milling said, "Madam Mayor we're dealing with at this point and time when two people who would like to make a proposal for the grant. Seems to me we're spending a lot of time expressing personal differences about how things have been done in the past. He said he would like to finish the discussion with Mr. Brown as to his contract, hear a presentation from Ms. Lathan on her contract and then he would like to have a vote. Councilman Milling said there was an attachment to On Point Services. Mr. Brown said he put that in there because Haidee Stith is their grant writer if they need one. He said Haidee has done a lot of work for the City and she's done some other work for them. Councilman Bruce asked Mr. Brown to tell her what was that that Councilman Milling presented to him before he started his presentation. Mr. Brown said it was a letter from Ms. Lathan which he has not looked at. Councilman Bruce said she thought it was her contract. Mr. Brown said, "No, it was not her contract, I don't think". A gentleman in the audience asked if it was public information (the letter) and Councilman Milling said he would think so. The gentleman said he would like to see a copy of it too. Mayor Hines called on Ms. Lathan to respond, but her Attorney Mr. Patrick McLaughlin from Wukela Law Firm spoke on her behalf. Mr. McLaughlin said Ms. Lathan has presented her contract to them so they don't feel the need for her to explain her contract. He said he don't personally know Mr. Brown, but he knows his firm and he knows the reputation to be a fine engineering firm. He said he understands that Darlington has history with both companies and that both companies have performed business satisfactorily because you are considering doing more business with both of them. Mr. McLaughlin said as Council they know more about the procurement process and what their role is in that process more than he does. He said a primary role for them to consider is their fiduciary responsibility to the City. He said you can't get much lower of a price than "free". Mr. McLaughlin said he would like to stand up for Ms. Lathan at this time and point out that there are other factors that go into procurement and municipal government decisions about how to select contracts. Mr. McLaughlin said in addition to fiduciary responsibility Council has other concerns such as inclusion, such as diversity of the awarding of contracts and checks and balances sometimes. He said if certain Council members have concerns about the way some things have been handled in the past, perhaps is responsible and perhaps it is doing your due diligence to have another outfit administering the award. Mr. McLaughlin said he would hope

if there are any complaints about Ms. Lathan's work, considering the fact that she has not only in the past successfully obtained grants for the City of Darlington and administered those grants, and it's his understanding she continues to do that now. At least the administration role. He said if members of Council have concerns about anything in the way she's done her business, he would hope that that's what Mr. Garland is for. Mr. McLaughlin said to his knowledge this has not been done. Councilman Gardner started to ask Mr. McLaughlin a question, but Mayor Hines told him to wait until Mr. McLaughlin finish. Mr. McLaughlin said he doesn't have a problem entertaining a question Councilman Gardner would like to ask. Councilman Gardner said this is a statement for clarity. He said Ms. Lathan was in a work session with them and they asked her about her Master Storm Water Plan and it didn't include the whole City. Councilman Gardner said Ms. Lathan stated that it did, but they were not able to find where it included the whole City. Mayor Hines hit the gavel and said this is not about....Mr. McLaughlin asked Councilman Gardner if that a question about Ms. Lathan's administration of any of the grants and he said, "No". Mr. McLaughlin asked if this is a question about her obtaining any grants for the City of Darlington? Councilman Gardner said, "It's a question of, I think, whether we could believe that we are getting a truthful answer out of her because we have....(There were gasps from the audience) Councilman Gardner said when they discussed previously with her about storm water master plan that the City has that she performed for them, she said it was complete and she said it includes the whole City and they can't find where it includes anything on the other side...Mayor Hines hit the gavel and said this has nothing to do with that tonight. Councilman Gardner said it has to do with her ability to do the job that we hired her to do. Mayor Hines told Councilman Gardner to let Mr. McLaughlin finish and he can ask his question on the end. Councilman Gardner said Mr. McLaughlin said he would entertain his question, so he was just finishing it, so he can let him continue. Mr. McLaughlin said, "Councilman Gardner is it your assertion then that these are problems with her administration of grants that she obtained and administered for the City of Darlington"? Councilman Gardner said he would have to ask Councilman Milling for the legal jargon that he would need to use or either the City Attorney. Councilman Gardner said, "What I do know is there are a couple of different grants that she has administered that we've had a couple of different issues with in this City so that gives him reserves. Mr. McLaughlin said, "And your concern is with her administration of those grants"? Councilman Gardner asked Mr. Garland if Ms. Lathan administered the Renaissance Grant and Mr. Garland

said Phase 3. Councilman Gardner asked Mr. Garland if this was the grant where they had the dam in the middle of it where the water has to fill up to a certain level before it continues down. Mr. Garland said that was Phase 2. Council Gardner said, “So she did not administer Phase 2 and Mr. Garland said Phase 2 was administered by Pee Dee COG. Councilman Gardner said, “Then I do not have a problem with her administering that grant”. I have an issue with Renaissance Phase 2, I guess”. Mr. McLaughlin said, “Then again, I would come back to the fact that he would hope if the City had issues with someone they are currently in a contract with for providing for professional services, that those issues would be talked about with them”. Mr. McLaughlin said Ms. Lathan’s work speaks for itself. He said in casting your vote tonight that you don’t just look at the fiduciary duty that you have, you also look at the duty you have to consider those other factors and also consider whether or not all the regulations and statutes regarding procurement have been followed. He said there was a little bit of concern (he was just retained recently so he hasn’t had a chance to watch the video from that last meeting) because Ms. Lathan’s contract was published in public and somebody else was able to submit a contract after having heard her information. He said he don’t believe this Council has shared with Ms. Lathan Mr. Brown’s contract. Mr. McLaughlin asked Council to consider all of those options when you vote on this grant. Councilwoman Bruce told Mr. McLaughlin that he alluded several times that Lathan Consulting has a contract with the City to do these grants and she asked Mr. Garland if that was correct that Ms. Lathan is our grant writer under contract? Councilwoman Bruce said she is trying to get clarity about the grant for the Joe Louis Lift Station. She wanted to know if Ms. Lathan is under contract to write the grant for the lift station and Mr. Garland said, “No”. Mr. McLaughlin said if he indicated that he is sorry. Councilwoman Baccus said she understands that Councilwoman Bruce asked Mr. Brown if he would do the application free and the management free and he said, “yes”. She said in the packet it has a breakdown of the fees charged. Mr. Brown said that’s his standard rates and it refers to extra work in the contract if they need him to do work beyond the contract. Mr. Brown said he never said he would do the engineering free. Councilwoman Baccus said the contract she is reading, he is asking them to sign an engineering contract before they ever get the grant. She said instead of the engineering part of the contract being bid, if they sign that contract, they are saying they are just going to hand you the engineering part without ever knowing if we’re going to get the grant or not. Mr. Brown said if you don’t get the grant you don’t owe me anything. Councilwoman Baccus said if we get the grant then we just committing to giving you the

engineering and Mr. Brown said, "That is correct". She said what happen to bidding it out by law? Mr. Brown said they will bid out the construction. Councilman Milling asked Mr. Brown if his ethics and your billings have ever been questioned by the City in thirty-five years and Mr. Brown said, "Very seldom." Councilpersons Reed and Baccus said, "and that's the problem". Councilman Milling asked Mr. Brown if anybody has ever penalized him in connection with the work you've done. Mr. Brown said, "No". Mr. Brown said after you trust somebody you try to live up to that trust. He said the City doesn't have to do that they can go out for proposals on every job if they want to. Councilwoman Reed said they haven't done that and Mr. Brown said you haven't done that but that's not his fault. Mayor Hines said someone was sent here about 10 years ago and she was asked about the report and she said she never seen the report. She said that report never got in her hands. (Council were talking among themselves because they didn't know what she was talking about). Mr. Garland said in 2006 Council agreed along with then City Manager, Mr. Rodney Langley to bring in a consultant who was the Assistant City Manager for the City of Columbia, Mr. Charles Williams. Mr. Garland said Mr. Charles Williams came in and spent about 5 or 6 months here and did a complete review of the Water & Sewer Department. He said the biggest issue that the found was we had more than \$600,000 in uncollectible water bills and they were written off. He said staff would go about 3 to 5 months without collecting any water bills. Mr. Garland said Mr. Williams felt like Davis & Brown was doing too much work in too many areas for the City and we should cut our work load down with Davis & Brown. Mr. Garland said it was around \$800,000 or \$900,000 a year that Davis & Brown agreed to cut back, but he thinks they cut back somewhere between \$600,000-\$650,000. He said the person who was Water Superintendent at that time resigned and went to work for the County and they brought in Mr. Kinsaul in July 2007. Mayor Hines said she asked about our men doing some of the work because we were paying Davis & Brown a lot of money. Councilman Segars said prior to Davis & Brown taking such an integral part of our operations of our system we were constantly getting letters from DHEC about water quality or sewer and they were constantly getting written up. He said since Davis & Brown has been in his capacity serving the City we don't get those letters anymore his company is making sure that we're conformed with what DHEC requires us to do. Mayor Hines said we've gotten letters about it since then. Councilwoman Reed asked Mr. Brown what kind of funds he is receiving from the City now on a yearly basis from the City. Mr. Kinsaul said a \$100,000 a year. Mr. Garland said instead of estimating that he will get

those numbers and put it together. He said they will get the numbers for 2016-2017 and what we've done so far this year. **Councilwoman Baccus made a motion that we grant the application to Ms. Lathan due to the fact that she qualifies to do the grant. Councilwoman Reed seconded the motion.** Mayor Hines asked for a show of hands. **Councilpersons Reed, Baccus and Mayor Hines voted for the motion. Councilpersons Carolyn Bruce, Bryant Gardner, John Milling and John Segars voted against the motion - (Vote 4-3)**

**Councilman Bryant Gardner made a motion to approve the Joe Louis Lift Station upgrade grant approval for Davis & Brown Construction. Councilman John Segars seconded the motion.** Mayor Hines asked for a show of hands. **Councilpersons John Milling, John Segars, Carolyn Bruce and Bryant Gardner voted for the motion. Councilpersons Elaine Reed, Sheila Baccus and Mayor Hines voted against the motion.**

**ADJOURNMENT**

*Upon motion of Councilwoman Sheila Baccus, seconded by Councilwoman Carolyn Bruce, the meeting adjourned at 7:00 PM.*

---

Mayor

ATTEST:

---

Clerk & Treasurer